

Summary of school submissions for the Beaches LINK Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) March 2021

1. Anzac park PS
2. Balgowlah North PS
3. NBSC BALGOWLAH BOYS
4. Cammeray Public school
5. Cammeraygal High school
6. Marist Catholic College North Shore
7. Northbridge Public School
8. Neutral Bay PS
9. St Cecilia's Catholic school
10. St Kierans Primary school
11. St Philip Neri
12. Seaforth Public School
13. Wenona

Representing approx. 10,000 students and their families

3 comments – all had objections

10 as objections

School	Who	Verdict	Themes
Anzac Park Public School	P&C	Objects	<p>The association would prefer the DP to reject this application in its entirety. The association objects to the BL</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Truth and transparency – submission goes into detail where this wasn't the case with the Western Harbour Tunnel and consultations were not genuine • Proper responses required – general responses not acceptable. For WHT Minister and Premier said things were OK because they rely on the 'science'. Specific concerns need to be addressed • Why is the beaches tunnel required – the EIS and presentations did not adequately or accurately set out the need for this project • Business case – how is the immense cost justified? Small increases in time saving noted in the EIS. Release the business case • Business case for other options -rail referred to briefly, provide costings for filtration on stacks • Consultation – real interaction with the community before it provides any approval terms • Climate – adversely affect climate – our children are left to clean up the lack of forethought. Contributors to climate change include – pollution, removal of trees, release of toxic chemicals, destruction of Flat Rock Gully, adverse noise and air pollution during construction • Construction pollution – increase in heavy vehicles. EIS to be amended to minimise adverse impacts of air and noise pollution, including alert style monitoring accessible by community • Operation pollution – lack of filtration on pollution stacks. <p>Background given</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Biodiversity – significantly and adversely impact Sydney Harbour, MH, Manly Dam and FRG • Contamination – FRG, Cammeray Golf course, Warringah Fwy, MH, Wakehurst parkway – complete proper contamination assessment • Traffic – EIS amended to include modelling that incorporates research • First nation archaeological sites • Human impact • Affirmative action – real time monitoring during construction periods with 24/7 community access

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of time to completely review the EIS
Balgowlah North PS	P&C	Object	<p>Is the tunnel still appropriate in a post COVID world?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revisiting the tunnel justification. Request new data points, halt the development process to allow for a suitable review and to publicly release results <p>Construction impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dust, noise, vibration and heavy traffic through the area – stats given on impact to the suburb Reconsider impact of trucks/vehicles, disincentivise commuters using local streets as rat runs Keep safe for our children to walk or ride around local community <p>Ventilation stacks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are several schools, preschools, childcare centres, and sporting fields within the vicinity of all the proposed ventilation stacks and from a parent's point of view, the increased level of pollution is unacceptable. Need filtration <p>Environmental impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Contaminated sediment in MH Destruction of bushlands due to a possible 96% reduction in water flow Discharge of 428,000 L per day of wastewater into Queenscliff lagoon and beach Pollution of Manly Dam Loss of recreational activity <p>“We understand that in life, it is important to move forward, but not at all costs. If anything, COVID should teach us that we need to look after what we have got, each other and the environment so we can all live together sustainably, leaving the world in a better place for future generations. We are not sure the tunnel is the answer”</p>
NBSC BALGOWLAH BOYS	P&C ASSOCIATION	Objects	<p>Very detailed 20 page submission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The class of 2028 will be subjected to 6 years of impacts Not enough time to review EIS <p>NBSC Balgowlah Boys P&C Association has grave concerns on the following-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ballie Boys next to Balgowlah Golf Course construction site Construction – noise and vibration impacts on construction if access road, truck movements – adversely affecting concentration and learning. No noise measurements for the school, cumulative exceedance if acceptable noise levels during construction. Balgowlah Oval is relied on heavily for organised sport and for recess and lunch. Noise, dust and vibration. Access must be maintained Traffic and road safety – EIS states 5 years of vehicle access to Balgowlah construction site, intersections already operating near capacity in 2016, congestion will only increase. Reduced safety for accessing schools on foot, by bicycle, by skateboard. 2.5 trucks per minute. Concern during exams Air quality impacts – zone 4 in air quality – high sensitivity to dust. Chapter 12-22 of the EIS states that even with rigorous air quality management in place and effective best practice management measures, there is the risk that land uses near construction works might experience dust impacts. These impacts are heightened for students and community members with existing respiratory issues and allergies. Contaminated soil Access to open space – no grass area on school grounds, reliant on Balgowlah oval as only active open space. Plan implies Balgowlah will be unusable until 2025 at the earliest

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Removal of vegetation on school grounds on the boundary of the school. A valuable source of shade and noise attenuation • Operation – noise impact, traffic and pedestrian safety, air pollution – 200m from Balgowlah oval and 322m from the school, loss of open space <p>Mitigative measures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultation (see details page 12) to include paid project/liaison office who will work with the school. Consulted on changes made to the design by contractors, a compensation fund for adverse health and safety effects • Noise impacts – BB to be a noise Monitoring Location, plans developed, a working group established, all windows for classrooms and spaces for exams be double glazed to reduce noise, provision of off site venue, penalties for breaches • Air quality – inclusion of school as a community receiver site • High capacity dust filtration units installed in every classroom, filtration devices fitted • Traffic – actively involved in traffic management plans, heavy truck movement cease for school start, school finish, arvo sport, rebuild overpass • Public transport – bus stops retained, new bus stops • School facilities – structural analysis of all school buildings • Access to open space and sports facilities – creation of multi purpose facilities for sport and education
<p>Cammeray Public school</p>	<p>P&C</p>	<p>Objects</p>	<p>“Poorly scoped yet evident risks in relation to contamination, noise, dust and construction traffic are of particular concern to the school community as are the documented increases in pollution around the school and it's sports fields once the tunnel is built. Our school catchment crosses into Naremburn and hundreds of children will need to travel to school across the major truck route at Brook St and again across Miller St which undoubtedly will receive a higher level of traffic to avoid the construction route. It is particularly concerning that benefits such as travel times are unable to be verified.</p> <p>The school supports the communities call for the release of the business case that evidences benefits claimed, a phase 2 contamination study and a public transport alternatives study that demonstrates the merits of this project over a public transport solution. Given the level of under assessed risk presented in the EIS this information should be provided to the community in the form of a re-released EIS for public consultation”</p> <p>See letter from Sydney Children’s Hospital Randwick included in this submission.</p> <p>P&C objects to the project until such time as: 1) A full phase 2 contamination study is completed and published to accurately assess risk and decide if adequate mitigation is possible and cost effective 2) A comparative public transport review is completed that demonstrates the best option in terms of traffic, construction impact, health, biodiversity and sustainability. 3) A business case is published which evidences the travel time savings claimed and the congestion benefits assumed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Health and safety objections (12 in total) • Traffic and congestion (during construction and once operational) • Climate, sustainability and environment (9 points) • Mitigations outlined (before approval and if approved what needs to be mandated)

			<p>Excellent diagrams from the EIS included as they relate to Cammeray PS</p> <p>Excellent submission - https://www.planningportal.nsw.gov.au/major-projects/submission/783801</p>
<p>Cammeraygal High school</p>	<p>P&C</p>	<p>Objects</p>	<p>Cumulative impact with the Western Harbour Tunnel and WFU (2021-2028)</p> <p>Unacceptable impacts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Air pollution – sensitive receivers worse off with increased surface traffic • Increase in particulate matter • Growth of vehicle reliance • Increased construction traffic • Long term traffic congestion – only access point to Beaches Link via Berry St (other than Artarmon) • Pedestrian safety • Noise • Contamination – from Warringah Freeway and sports fields at FR reserve and Cammeray Golf Course • Dust risks – from spoil outside in FRG and Cammeray Golf Course • Assumptions made in the EIS • Climate change • Biodiversity and loss of greenspace – Cammeray Golf Club and FRG • Environmental impacts • Cammeraygal P&C not consulted as stakeholders <p>Cammeraygal HS P&C objects to the project overall until</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Surface traffic assessment • Public transport alternatives assessed • Business case given • Phase 2 contamination study and results released to the public • Filtration of tunnel, reduce vehicle emissions • Additional crossings/ overpasses and underpasses to ensure safe passage of children • No truck marshalling in local streets • Spoil not to be permitted outside of sheds, utility shed at Cammeray Golf Club to be underground • Tunnel design to have a dedicated public transport corridor • Carbon neutral • Consultation throughout the project
<p>Catholic Community of North Harbour</p> <p>Fr David Austin and Co-chairs of the Parish Pastoral Council</p>	<p>Allambie, Allambie hts, Balgowlah, Balgowlah Hts, Clontarf, Beacon Hill, Brookvale, Manly Vale, North Balgowlah, North Manly and Seaforth</p>	<p>Comment</p>	<p>2 major areas of concern – EIS does not acknowledge St Cecilia’s School and St Kieran’s school</p> <p>Anticipated impact of St Cecilia’s school and St Cecilia’s church</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Air quality – affecting both St C schools and Church – monitoring of air quality requested • Noise and vibration • Traffic congestion – concern on local streets becoming rat runs and concerns with parking and safety for the school and church at peak times <p>Parish pastoral council requests</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Traffic management plans and standby areas for trucks • Forecast traffic volumes during and post construction on surrounding streets • Dust and noise management plan

Marist Catholic College North Shore	P&F of St Mary's campus	Objects	<p>EIS be reissued for public consultation with a:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A full Phase 2 Contamination Assessment completed including publicly available testing data (widespread contamination is identified but underassessed) • A comparative mass transit alternatives assessment ie an assessment that demonstrates the superiority of this project over a mass transit option • A Business Case - which provides data to substantiate the travel time savings quoted, re-assesses the local traffic impacts (as per Willoughby and North Sydney Councils concerns) and more fully addresses costs
Northbridge Public School	Parents and Citizens Association	Objects	<p>Objections related to the proposed Flat Rock Gully tunnelling site, Tunks Park and Middle Harbour environment (off Northbridge):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dust pollution from the dive site FRG, contaminated soil and sandstone dust • Dredging at MH • More testing on contamination • Contaminated spoil not to be stored not to be stored or retained onsite at FRG • Bushland regenerated after completion of project at FRG • Trucks disrupting traffic flow from FRG • Excessive construction noise and vibration • Negatively impact significant wildlife corridors – FRG, Manly Dam, Marine ecosystems MH • Counteracts principles of Ecological Sustainable development • FRG is a declared wildlife protection area ad should not be disturbed • Replace trees 3 to 1 • Biodiversity poorly scoped in EIS • Groundwater drawdown • Engage consultant to measure water quality in creek and MH • It is vital FRG is restored to bushland
Neutral Bay Public School	P&C	Comment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • potential environmental and day-to-day impacts of the Tunnel during its constructions and ongoing impact to residents in the area • unfiltered exhaust stacks – comment on particulate levels • Realtime/alert style monitors at Cammeray and WCC – dust and contamination • No spoil to be retained onsite at WCC and Cammeray oval • Bushland to be restored at FRG
St Cecilia's Catholic school	Advisory Committee		<p>“We are seeking to protect the health, safety and well-being of all St Cecilia’s school children ... We also note that the Catholic Schools Office for Broken Bay endorses this objection and will be working with us and St Kieran’s to ensure the issues identified are addressed”.</p> <p>Our concerns are intensified due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the extra additional lane added to in the modified link road design; • the closure of the Sydney Road end of Maretimo Street junction; and • diagrams of the ventilation stack indicating its location nearer to our school (in contradiction to what is outlined in the EIS). <p>EIS critical omission - St Cecilia’s Catholic School is incorrectly characterised with regards to noise impacts. Figure 10-4 identifies our site as a place of worship and not a school. We occupy a dual site. Please update the assessment noise forecast impact. (see more detail in submission). School 200m from construction site boundary</p>

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Best practice emissions filtration management, community based quality monitoring, data available, plans, penalties, a compensation system, independent review of air emissions at ventilation outlets, nose reduction barriers, respite periods, communication, construction traffic to be fitted with non toal reversing alarms • Loss of green space – Balgowlah oval • Worker and contractor parking, traffic congestion. Time based restrictions for use of local roads during school zone times, no trucks allowed to idle. Construction hotline to be established, sticker system for all project related vehicles and trucks, new pedestrian crossing • Safe student movement • Clarification BL and what falls with the scope of Northern Beaches council operations <p>Appendix includes their Beaches Link Design Phase submission August 2018</p>
St Kierans Primary School	Advisory Council and school principal	Comment	<p>In support of St Cecilia’s Catholic School Advisory committee (that objected)</p> <p>Anticipated impact on operation of the school</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Air quality • Traffic congestion
Seaforth Public School	Parent & Citizens Association	Objects	<p>Earlier plans showed tunnel entrance and stacks further from the school.</p> <p>“This contradicts indications given to the school community after engaging constructively in the community consultation process. International studies have shown the dangers to health, particularly in children, of being near many open lanes of traffic. This includes increases in asthma and impacts on child brain development. This project would increase traffic lanes from 6 to 12 near the school, including a traffic light, and add a nearby smoke stack.</p> <p>We should not take risks when it comes to child health and safety. This was the position expressed by Planning Minister Rob Stokes, when he was Education Minister, stating: “I won’t be party to putting stacks near kids ... There is no way in hell that I’d support any development that would put the lives of pupils, teachers and parents at risk”.</p>
St Philip Neri Primary School	P&F	Objects	<p>We ask for the following mitigation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dust and pollution monitoring from Flat Rock Gully at WLCentre • More testing to determine the extent of the contamination at the tip site of FRG • Contaminated soil not be stored or retained onsite at FRG • Dredging of MH – silt curtains to the sea bed. Continuous water testing at Northbridge baths and sailing club • Undertake full bushland regeneration at FRG after the project consistent with the Environmental Conservation zoning of the site • Increased traffic on Sailors Bay Road as a result of FR Drive construction vehicles • BL will negatively impact significant wildlife corridors • 3 to 1 tree replacement in FRG • Biodiversity poorly scoped in EIS. Full study of wildlife needed for FRG and MH
Wenona School	Chief Operating officer	Objects	<p>Air pollution – combination of surface emissions and stack emissions exceeding current levels</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “The Project’s lack of filtration to minimise these emissions, given the known danger of emissions to people of all ages, is unacceptable”

			<p>Local traffic and pedestrian amenity. The school suggests:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Miller St traffic does not increase• Berry Street entrance underground, near Pacific Highway• The School requires a consent condition that the Miller/Ridge intersection be reviewed to optimise pedestrian and traffic flow in all directions, instead of the current inefficient signalling arrangements which prejudice Ridge St <p>Night closures on Warringah Freeway</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• as it will push traffic onto local streets, to the detriment of residential boarders and North Sydney residents generally <p>Risk of cracking, subsidence and similar building impacts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• school has sensitive heritage structures – dilapidation reports exceeding normal industry standards. Special design arrangements be made <p>Lack of transparent consideration of public transport alternatives</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• EIS does not genuinely consider alternatives to a motorway• requests genuine consideration be given to visionary and long-term public transport alternatives <p>Pollution risk during construction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sporting facilities near Flat Rock Gully – real time dust/pollution monitoring and dust mitigation measures
--	--	--	--